



**Canada:  
The State  
of the  
Federation  
2017**

**Canada at 150:  
Federalism and  
Democratic  
Renewal**

*Edited by  
Elizabeth Goodyear-Grant and  
Kyle Hanniman*

Institute of Intergovernmental Relations  
Queen's Policy Studies Series  
School of Policy Studies, Queen's University  
McGill-Queen's University Press  
Montréal & Kingston | London | Ithaca

© 2019 Institute of Intergovernmental Relations, School of Policy Studies,  
Queen's University at Kingston, Canada.



School of Policy Studies  
Room 412, Robert Sutherland Hall  
138 Union Street  
Kingston, ON K7L 3N6 Canada  
[www.queensu.ca/iigr/](http://www.queensu.ca/iigr/)

All rights reserved. The use of any part of this publication for reproduction, transmission in any form, or by any means (electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise), or storage in a retrieval system without the prior written consent of the publisher—or, in case of photocopying or other reprographic copying, a licence from the Canadian Copyright Licensing Agency—is an infringement of the copyright law. Enquiries concerning reproduction should be sent to the Institute of Intergovernmental Relations at the address above.

---

# CONTENTS

vii	Acknowledgements
ix	Biographies
1	Introduction <i>Elizabeth Goodyear-Grant and Kyle Hanniman</i>

## GENERAL ASSESSMENTS

19	1	Federalism Reform and Democratic Renewal for a Country Based on Incomplete Conquests <i>Peter H. Russell</i>
33	2	Canadian Federalism, Democracy, and Political Legitimacy <i>Thomas O. Hueglin</i>

## DEMOCRATIC INSTITUTIONS

59	3	Notwithstanding the Charter: Does Section 33 Accommodate Federalism? <i>Janet L. Hiebert</i>
85	4	The Challenge of Modernizing an Upper Chamber of a Federal Parliament in a Constitutional Monarchy: The Senate of Canada in the Twenty-first Century <i>David E. Smith</i>

- 97     5     The Perils and Paranoia of Senate Reform: Does Senate Independence Threaten Canadian Democracy?  
*Emmett Macfarlane*
- 111    6     Competing Diversities: Representing “Canada” on the Supreme Court  
*Erin Crandall and Robert Schertzer*
- 133    7     Who Participated? Examining Citizen Participation in Electoral Reform  
*Patricia Mockler and Jonathan Rose*
- 161    8     Normative Justifications for Democratic Design: The Case of Canadian Electoral Reform  
*Anna Drake and Margaret Moore*
- 181    9     The Federalist Case for Electoral Reform in Canada  
*Laura Levick*

## FEDERALISM FOR DIVERSITY: FRENCH AND ENGLISH

- 203    10    Policy on Québec Affirmation and Canadian Relations  
*Jean-Marc Fournier*
- 211    11    Federalism “Plus”? Carving a Space of Non-Territorial Autonomy in a Federal State: The Case of Official-Language Minorities in Canada  
*Stéphanie Chouinard*

## FEDERALISM FOR DIVERSITY: INDIGENOUS GOVERNANCE

- 227    12    Beyond Crown Sovereignty: Good Governance and Treaty Constitutionalism  
*Kiera Ladner*

- 253 13 Nation Tables and the BCTC Tic-Tac-Toe?  
*Tony Penikett*

## INTERGOVERNMENTAL RELATIONS

- 271 14 Imagining Canada: Narratives of Federalism in Intergovernmental  
Organizations  
*Jennifer Wallner*
- 291 15 The Politics of Federal-Local Intergovernmental Relations in  
Canada  
*Zachary Spicer*



---

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The genesis of this volume is the Institute of Intergovernmental Relations' (IIGR) 2017 State of the Federation conference, which was held June 16 to 17 at Queen's University's Donald Gordon Centre. The conference, entitled *Canada at 150: Federalism and Democratic Renewal*, took the opportunity to reflect on the federal Liberals' democratic reform agenda and—in light of Canada's sesquicentennial year—the legacy and future of Canada's federal and democratic institutions. While contributors used a wide range of criteria to evaluate Canada's democratic and federal architecture, we were struck by their emphasis on the need to accommodate diversity. Many of our contributors believe Canada's democratic and federal institutions have done a reasonably good job of promoting, protecting, and recognizing the identities and interests of the original federal partners. But they also see room to deepen those commitments and extend them to a much broader range of groups, including Indigenous peoples.

Our first acknowledgement goes to Mary Kennedy, the administrative support and events coordinator at the IIGR. Mary has organized a number of State of the Federation conferences and her knowledge, organizational skill, and patience were as indispensable as ever. We also thank the Queen's School of Policy Studies (SPS)—and Executive Director David Walker, Lynn Freeman, and Chris Cornish in particular—for their financial, organizational and promotional support. We also thank Bob Wolfe, David Walker, Lynn Freeman, and other members of the SPS for promoting the conference in the context of the *Public Policy & Canada's 150* initiative. Our home department, Political Studies, was also instrumental as a sponsor, source of contributors and as an open, supportive, and stimulating environment for incubating our conference ideas and plans. We thank Department Head Zsuzsa Csergo in particular for securing the department's financial support.

We also gratefully acknowledge financial support from a from Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council (SSHRC) Connection Grant (# 611-2016-0581), and SSHRC's special *Canada at 150* funding competition.

We are grateful for the work of our chapter authors and their exciting contributions to the volume and conference themes. In addition, we would like to thank a

number of conference speakers whose names do not appear in the table of contents, but who greatly enriched our discussion and thinking nonetheless. In no particular order, these attendees were Julie Simmons, Jörg Broschek, Craig McFadyen, Nadia Verrelli, Leslie Seidle, Darian (“Wiiwakaa’ige”) Baskatawan, Josée Bergeron, Benoit-Antoine Bacon, Janet Mason, and Peter Wallace. Finally, we also wish to acknowledge the support of David Elder and Bob Young—two important members of the IIGR and broader federalism communities whose engaging and insightful contributions to this and past IIGR events will be sorely missed. Bob was a co-editor of the last *State of the Federation* volume, which was dedicated to him and his immense impact on the field.

In preparing this volume for publication, as well as assistance at the conference itself, we are grateful for the diligent and thorough work of Rebecca Wallace, a senior PhD student in Political Studies at Queen’s, as well as assistance from Chris Abbott, also a PhD student in the department. Thanks are also due to the SPS Publications Program and McGill-Queen’s University Press, which helped shepherd the volume through the production process. We are particularly grateful to SPS general editor Kim Richard Nossal, SPS Publications Program coordinator Mark Howes, and expert copy editor Anne Holley-Hime.



---

# BIOGRAPHIES

## EDITORS

*Elizabeth Goodyear-Grant* is an associate professor of political science at Queen's University, and the director of the Queen's Institute of Intergovernmental Relations and the Canadian Opinion Research Archive. Her research focuses on elections and political behaviour, political communication, and the representation of women. She is the author of *Gendered News: Media Coverage and Electoral Politics in Canada* (UBC Press 2013), which won the 2016 Pierre Savard Award from the International Council of Canadian Studies, and was shortlisted for the 2014 Donald Smiley Prize. She is also a co-editor of *Federalism and the Welfare State in a Multicultural World* (McGill-Queen's University Press 2018).

*Kyle Hanniman* is an assistant professor of political studies and former associate director of the Institute of Intergovernmental Relations at Queen's University. His research interests include comparative federalism, political economy, public debt and Canadian politics. He is writing a book on fiscal federalism and government default risk.

## AUTHORS

*Stéphanie Chouinard* is an assistant professor of Political Science at Royal Military College (Kingston) and Queen's University (cross-appointed). Her research focuses on autonomy arrangements as well as official-language minority and Indigenous rights. She has published in *Ethnopolitics*, the *Language Rights Review*, *Linguistic Minorities and Society*, and the *International Journal of Canadian Studies*, among others.

*Erin Crandall* is an assistant professor in the Department of Politics at Acadia University. Her work has appeared in the *Canadian Journal of Political Science*/*Revue canadienne de science politique*, *Public Policy and Administration*, and the *Canadian Journal of Women and the Law*, among other publications.

*Anna Drake* is an assistant professor in the Department of Political Science at the University of Waterloo. Her book manuscript, *Activism and Deliberative Democracy*, critiques deliberative democracy's inclusion framework and develops an approach that recognizes activism's distinct democratic contribution.

*Jean-Marc Fournier* represented the riding of Saint-Laurent in the National Assembly of Quebec from 2010 to 2018, and previously represented the riding of Châteauguay from 1994 to 2008. He served as the minister of revenue, government house leader, minister of education, minister of municipal affairs, and attorney general in the government of Jean Charest and was the interim leader of the Quebec Liberal Party from 2012 to 2013. He was the Quebec Minister of Canada Relations and the Francophonie from 2016–2018.

*Janet Hiebert* is a professor in the Department of Political Studies at Queen's University. Her most recent book is *Parliamentary Bills of Rights. The Experiences of New Zealand and the United Kingdom* (with James Kelly, Cambridge University Press 2015). She is the author of two books about the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, *Charter Conflicts: What is Parliament's Role?* (McGill-Queen's University Press 2002), and *Limiting Rights: The Dilemma of Judicial Review* (McGill-Queen's University Press 1996), along with numerous papers and chapters on the politics of rights and on campaign finance laws in Canada. She is also a past president of the Canadian Political Science Association.

*Thomas O. Hueglin* has been professor of political science at Wilfrid Laurier University since 1985. His research is focused on the history of political thought, and on comparative federalism. Recent book publications are *Comparative Federalism: A Systematic Inquiry*, (with Alan Fenna, second edition 2015), and *Classical Debates for the 21st Century: Rethinking Political Thought* (2008). Dr. Hueglin is currently writing a book on federalism in Canada for the University of Toronto Press.

*Kiera L. Ladner* is Canada Research Chair in Miyo we'citowin, Indigenous Governance and Digital Sovereignties and professor in the Department of Political Studies at the University of Manitoba, and former Canada Research Chair in Indigenous Politics and Governance. Her research focuses on Indigenous politics and governance; comparative constitutional law and Indigenous politics in Canada, Australia and New Zealand; digital sovereignties and archiving; and resurgence (in terms of both women and youth).

*Laura Levick* is an assistant professor in the Political Science Department at St. Thomas University and a former postdoctoral researcher at the Universidad de Santiago de Chile. She completed her PhD at Queen's University in 2017. Her research examines democracy and institutional change in Canada and Latin America.

*Emmett Macfarlane* is an associate professor of political science at the University of Waterloo. He is the author of *Governing from the Bench: The Supreme Court of Canada and the Judicial Role* (UBC Press 2013), and the editor of *Constitutional Amendment in Canada* (University of Toronto Press 2016) and *Policy Change, Courts, and the Canadian Constitution* (University of Toronto Press 2018).

*Patricia Mockler* is a PhD student in the Department of Political Studies at Queen's University. Her doctoral research examines the implications of citizens' assemblies for political behaviour. Her broader research agenda includes work on deliberative democracy, political participation, and the nature of citizenship in established democracies. Patricia is also an experienced deliberative facilitator; she most recently co-facilitated Fisheries and Oceans Canada's National Advisory Panel on Marine Protected Areas Standards.

*Margaret Moore* is professor in the Political Studies Department at Queen's University, where she teaches political theory. Her most recent book was *A Political Theory of Territory* (Oxford University Press 2015), which won the 2017 biennial Best Book Prize of the Canadian Philosophical Association.

*Tony Penikett* is a senior associate at Simon Fraser University's Centre for Dialogue, and the author of *Hunting the Northern Character* (UBC Press 2017) and *First Nation Treaty Making in British Columbia* (Douglas & McIntyre 2006). He is a former Yukon premier, BC deputy minister of negotiations and Fulbright Arctic Scholar with the Jackson School of International Relations at the University of Washington.

*Jonathan Rose* is associate professor at Queen's University where he teaches and writes on Canadian politics, electoral reform, and political communication. He has written, co-written and edited four books and a number of articles both in the scholarly and popular press. With André Blais, R. Kenneth Carty, Patrick Fournier, and Henk van der Kolk, he co-authored *When Citizens Decide: Lessons From Citizen Assemblies on Electoral Reform*, which was the recipient of the Seymour Martin Lipset Best Book Award from the Canadian Politics Section of the American Political Science Association.

*Peter H. Russell* is a university professor emeritus at the University of Toronto where he taught political science from 1958 to 2016. He was the founding principal of Senior College at the University of Toronto and is a past president of the Canadian Political Science Association. His most recent book is *Canada's Odyssey: A Country Based on Incomplete Conquests*, published by the University of Toronto Press in 2017.

*Robert Schertzer* is an assistant professor at the University of Toronto. He publishes and teaches on the intersection of three areas: federalism, constitutional politics, and the management of diversity. Prior to joining the University of Toronto, he spent a decade with the federal public service working in the areas of intergovernmental relations and social policy.

*David E. Smith, OC, FRSC*, is currently adjunct professor at Ryerson University. He taught at the University of Saskatchewan from 1964 until 2004 and is a previous president of the Canadian Political Science Association. His publications include a trilogy of works on each of the parts of parliament. *The People's House of Commons: Theories of Democracy in Contention* won the Donner Prize for best book in Canadian public policy in 2007.

*Zachary Spicer* is a lecturer in the University of Western Ontario's Local Government Program and an associate at the University of Toronto Innovation Policy Lab.

*Jennifer Wallner* is an associate professor with the School of Political Studies at the University of Ottawa. Her research centres on intergovernmental relations and public policy in a comparative context. New research considers the ways in which different groups within a federation may experience (non)recognition and (dis)empowerment. While on sabbatical, she worked with the Privy Council Office in the Intergovernmental Affairs Secretariat. She has published multiple academic and policy papers, has been a contributing co-editor of two books with UBC Press, and has written a book on federalism and education policy in Canada published by the University of Toronto Press.