Migration as a Wicked Security Problem

Phil Williams
University of Pittsburgh
Overview

• The Nature of Wicked Problems
• The Dimensions of the Migration/Refugee Challenge
• The Dynamics of the Migration Crisis in Europe
  • Push factors
  • Pull Factors
  • Facilitators
  • Inhibitors
• The Security Dimension
• Final Reflections
THE NATURE OF WICKED PROBLEMS

• Term was coined by West Churchman in response to a list of differences between technological problems and social problems presented by Horst Rittel
• Written up by Horst Rittel and Mel Weber
• Very closely related to complexity theory - small changes in context have large variations in outcomes
Essential Attributes of Wicked Problems

• No definite formulation of the problem—difficult to define/bound
• There are multiple explanations for the problem
• Each wicked problem is unique and constantly morphing
• Each wicked problem might be a symptom of another problem
• These problems have no clear solutions
• There is no immediate or ultimate test for solutions
• All attempts at solutions have unintended consequences
• The stakes are very high
3 KINDS OF PROBLEM

High

Wicked - Conflicting Worldviews

Complex - Expert Judgement

Tame - Consensus

Low

Uncertainty/ignorance

High

Source: Funtowicz & Ravetz
THE DIMENSIONS OF THE MIGRATION/REFUGEE PROBLEM

• A global problem
• Most of the burden is shared by neighbors in the global south
• Puts enormous and potentially overwhelming pressure on neighbors
• But there is also a drive to migrate from weak/failing/fierce states to the traditional Westphalian states
• Can be understood in terms of prospect theory – people make riskier decisions when faced with high costs of doing nothing – cannot be deterred
• Compounded by the problems of internal displacement
IOM World Migration Report 2018

• 244 million international migrants in the world in 2015 - 3.3% of the global population

• Very small minority of the global population - remaining within one’s country of birth overwhelmingly remains the norm

• Majority of people in the world do not migrate across borders

• Much larger numbers migrate within countries - 740 million internal migrants in 2009

• 2016 – 22.5 million refugees and 40.3 million internally displaced persons
65.6 million forcibly displaced people worldwide

Refugees 22.5 million
- 17.2 million under UNHCR mandate
- 5.3 million Palestinian refugees registered by UNRWA

Stateless people 10 million

Refugees resettled 189,300 in 2016

Where the world’s displaced people are being hosted
- 17% Europe
- 11% Asia and Pacific
- 26% Middle East and North Africa
- 30% Africa
- 16% Americas

55% of refugees worldwide came from three countries:
- South Sudan 1.4m
- Afghanistan 2.5m
- Syria 5.5m

Top hosting countries:
- Ethiopia 791,600
- Uganda 940,800
- Islamic Republic of Iran 979,400
- Lebanon 1.0m
- Pakistan 1.4m
- Turkey 2.9m
Benefits of Migration

- World Bank 2016: migrants from the poorest countries, on average, experienced a 15-fold increase in income, a doubling of school enrolment rates, and a 16-fold reduction in child mortality after moving to a developed country.

- Benefits to country of origin – remittances were $429 billion in 2016.

- Benefits to destination country - generate economic and other benefits for destination countries:
  - adds workers to the economy - increases GDP of host country.
  - migrants are often more likely to be risk takers - enormous contributions to many destination countries in areas such as technology, science, the arts etc.
  - positive effect on the labor market by increasing labor supply in sectors and occupations suffering from shortages of workers.
  - offsets ageing populations in developed countries - youth migration as a high risk asset for ageing countries.
Some Key Distinctions

• Refugees are people fleeing conflict or persecution. They are defined and protected in international law, and must not be expelled or returned to situations where their life and freedom are at risk.

• UNHCR - A ‘migrant' is fundamentally different from a refugee. Refugees are forced to flee to save their lives or preserve their freedom, but ‘migrant' describes any person who moves, usually across an international border, to join family members already abroad, to search for a livelihood, to escape a natural disaster, or for a range of other purposes.

• Refugees and migrants often employ the same routes, modes of transport, and networks.

• Migrants can be legal or illegal/informal.

• Difference between human smuggling and human trafficking.
The migrant/refugee crisis in Europe was a perfect storm. Populations move from areas of failed governance to Westphalian states. Some driven by conflict – Syria, Afghanistan, Somalia. Some are economic migrants not refugees. Some are from countries with repressive regimes - Eritrea. Russian actions in Syria exacerbated Europe’s refugee crisis – was this intent or inadvertent consequence of Russian support for Assad?
Number of 'detected' irregular migrants in the EU, Top-10 countries, 2014

**Total EU28**

- **Syria**
- **Eritrea**
- **Afghanistan**

(many of whom are applying for asylum)

70% of irregular foreigners in the EU are employed, experts suggest. Just over 1% of the EU27 labour force in 2009 may have been irregular.

**Number of unauthorized foreigners in the US, 2014**

Approx. 70% of the 11 million irregular foreigners in the US labour force are employed (8 million). 5% of the 160-million strong US labour force.


**Definition**

Irregular workers are non-citizens employed in regular jobs without authorization to work, such as foreigners who cross borders without detection and go to work without work authorization or with false documents.
The Routes

The way in
Main European migration routes
Detections of illegal border crossings
January-July 2015

- Western Balkans 102,342
  - From: Afghanistan 29%
  - Syria 28%
  - Kosovo 23%
- Eastern Mediterranean 132,240
  - From: Syria 59%
  - Afghanistan 25%
  - Pakistan 5%
- Western Mediterranean 6,698*
  - From: Syria 57%
    - Guinea 10%
    - Ivory Coast 5%
- Central Mediterranean 91,302
  - From: Eritrea 26%
  - Nigeria 12%
  - Unspecified sub-Saharan Africa 11%

Sources: Frontex; The Economist
*January-June 2015
Push Factors

• Endemic Conflict Situations – Syria, Iraq, Afghanistan
• Economic desperation
• Crisis of governance throughout much of the global south
• Political repression
• Climate change and extreme weather events
The Crisis of Governance

- A world of more and more perennially weak, corrupt, captured states that are unable or unwilling:
  - to meet the needs of their citizens (Neo-liberalism justification for state abdication of responsibility to citizens)
  - to provide an inclusive fold of protection and provision
  - to evoke the continued loyalty of their citizenry; to maintain the rule of law
  - to impose and maintain order in their major cities
  - to control their borders
Pull Factors

• Existing migrant communities – promise of assimilation - Sweden
• Transnational family networks – promise of family reunification
• Promise of a more secure life
• Promise of economic opportunities
• The migrant dream – Internet especially Facebook, and television
Facilitators: human smuggling networks

• Some are no more than informal travel agents
• Some are simply informal transportation companies
• But some are extremely predatory – pay upfront and stranded or sent to sea in overcrowded and dangerous boats
• Because informal/illegal - no standards or quality controls
• Smugglers have been extorted by mafias in Turkey
• Migrants/migrant camps in Sicily exploited by Sicilian mafia
• The refugees have created a demand for facilitators and transporters and that demand has been met.

• High profits

• One journalist suggested that Turkish smugglers who move refugees from Turkey to the Greek islands made as much as $6 million a day.

• Frontex described the Turkish smuggling industry as a “multi-million-euro business.”
The Human Smugglers

• Agadez, Niger - “gateway between West and North Africa”
• Smugglers “see themselves as businessmen, providing a service that Niger’s desert tribes have mastered” rather than as slave traders or organized crime
• Benefited from “Africa’s explosion of cellphones and social networks, which have linked smugglers to potential migrants”
• Musa moved goods Agadez to Libya, circumventing US and UN sanctions.
• After fall of Gaddafi “he and brothers bought a fleet of Toyota pickups stolen from Libya... They started taking between 25 and 100 migrants across the Sahara every week, charging about $300 each”
• Paid Niger police “between $150 and $250 per truck” for crossing into Libya (Kevin Sieff – WP)
The Ethiopian: Ermias Ghermay

• Lampedusa sinking in October 2013 – Anti-Mafia Magistrate Ferrara

• Identified “several wholly new, multinational organized crime syndicates, together worth around $7bn (€6bn) a year

• One key figure is Ghermay - “a complete service to migrants, running from the center of Africa to Libya to Italy to another country from there. It includes all accommodation, transport and food.”

• Ferrara - “a criminal operation like no other. No name, no fixed base, a fluid membership and, most remarkably, “totally without risk” since, unlike drugs payment is made in advance.”

• 20 to 30 boats a year – “colonels” part of a highly agile network

• Crowded and highly competitive market
The Prohibition-Price Dynamic

• Dominant motif is still Fortress Europe
• Smugglers been demonized
• The more difficult the migration process becomes, the more reliant migrants and refugees become on the people smugglers
• Shaw – smuggler often serves as “a guide and protector along a dangerous journey”
• Reitano: strengthening “border controls only enriches and empowers the more potent criminal networks involved in smuggling, with the perverse result of exacerbating criminality and insecurity.”
The inhibitors

• There are very few if any

• Goes back to prospect theory – people willing to risk crossing the Mediterranean because it holds out hope and all they have is despair.

• Although the human smugglers have been demonized they are a response to market demands not the cause
Recorded migrant deaths and missing migrants worldwide, 2016
The Refugee Crisis

• Humanitarian considerations v national security – how do we make the tradeoffs?
• Problems of integrating new migrants when
  • existing populations dealing with austerity
  • segments of migrant populations reject state authority
• Hostile segments of the population and the resurgence of the extreme right
The European Union Response

• Policy divergences among the members - Germany v Hungary
• Wicked problem compounded by a wicked policy process
• Dec 31, 2015 Cologne assaults – controversial in Germany
• Partly a matter of state capacity – states on the Balkan route have limited capacity (for example, Bulgaria)
• Sense that harm reduction strategy (Italian coastguard) encouraged more migrants
• Tensions between NGOs and EU/national governments
• The two deals – Turkey and Libya
Deal with Turkey on 18 March 2016 to end irregular migration from Turkey to EU

• All new irregular migrants crossing from Turkey to the Greek islands returned to Turkey
• For every Syrian returned to Turkey, another Syrian resettled to EU
• Turkey take necessary measures to prevent new sea or land routes for irregular migration from Turkey to EU
• Once irregular crossings substantially reduced, a Voluntary Humanitarian Admission Scheme activated
• The fulfilment of the visa liberalization roadmap by the end of June 2016.
• The EU further speed up the disbursement of the initially allocated €3 billion under the Facility for Refugees in Turkey.
• EU will provide additional funding—second 3 Billion Euros March 2018
Refugees Arriving Across the Mediterranean
Migrant sea arrivals in Europe by selected countries of arrival since January 2015

Data available until end of June
Source: UNHCR
Deal with Libya’s GNA Feb 2017

• Feb 2, 2017 Italy signed MOU with the Tripoli-based and UN-backed Government of National Accord (GNA).
• The Memorandum endorsed by EU Feb 3 at Malta Summit
• MOU facilitated the training/equipping of Libyan coastguard
• Italian government also reached ‘understandings’ with a variety of local actors, including militia in key coastal gateway towns
• Plus EU development support for Niger in return for criminalization of human smuggling
• Italian code of conduct for NGOs – limited ability to rescue at sea
Critiques of the Libya deal

• July 2017 “the boats stopped coming” as smugglers became gatekeepers
• Libyan detention centers described as ”hell”
• UN says EU policy is “inhuman”
• Cooption of the militias “creates instability, sabotages the state-building process and further drives the exploitation and abuse of migrants in the country” (Micallef and Reitano)
• “exchange of financial incentives, investments in infrastructure, and equipment and capacity building for border control agencies was a familiar deal for the Libyan people, as it echoed the Treaty of Friendship, Partnership and Cooperation signed in 2008 by Gaddafi and ...Berlusconi”
# Mediterranean Update

**1 January - 3 June**

**2018**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Arrivals by Sea</th>
<th>Deaths</th>
<th>Arrivals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>33,192</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>13,775</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>785</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>8,251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>45</td>
<td>11,119*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**2017**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Arrivals by Sea</th>
<th>Countries</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>72,158</td>
<td>Italy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Spain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Greece</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cyprus</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Italy**: 60,482, 1,647
- **Spain**: 4,161, 59
- **Greece**: 7,242, 37
- **Cyprus**: 273, 0

*As of 2 June 2018*
THE SECURITY DIMENSION

• Possibility of ISIS members among refugees from Syria, Iraq and Afghanistan
• Danger of migrants becoming radicalized particularly if stuck in refugee camps or marginalized and alienated in host country
• Danger of migrants becoming radicalized during journeys
• Danger of migrants being trafficked
• Danger of migrants forming or reconstituting gangs in host countries – the Black Axe and now the Vikings in Sicily
• So need more safeguards and better integration – human security
Radicalization Process

Grievance Narrative: Exploits resentment felt by marginalized groups and/or individuals.

Empowerment Narrative: Demonstrates that marginalized people can take effective action.

Terrorist Attacks: Mobilizes people to violent action.
Anger, Alienation, and Violence

General Population

Lack of opportunity and/or feeling of alienation

Alienates

Poverty
Marginalization
Discrimination

Disaffected Minority

Crime
Gang violence
Riots

Without radicalization
Angry Young People
No Ideology

With radicalization
Ideology

With radicalization
Terrorism
Insurgency
Cults

Courtesy of Thomas Mockaitis
FINAL REFLECTIONS

• The quick fixes are unsustainable
• Small dress rehearsals for massive flows of climate change refugees from coastal megacities
• Fragility of Lebanon, Jordan, and Egypt
• Human smuggling boom business of 21st Century
• Need to be more permissive rather than less
• This wicked problem will become even worse
• Thank you for listening

• Questions, Comments and Criticisms

• Contact: ridgway1@pitt.edu