Taxes, Transfers and Employment: Policy Changes in Canada in Recent Decades

David A. Green

Department of Economics
University of British Columbia
Research Fellow, Institute for Fiscal Studies
London

August, 2012
Three Main Points

1. The tax and transfer system changed fundamentally in the mid-90s

2. Employment focus has supplanted transfers

3. Nonetheless, inequality has not risen strongly raising questions about the role of the resource and construction booms. Is this sustainable? What are the trade-offs?
(Frenette, Green and Milligan(2010), Boadway and Cuff(2011))

Pre-1996:

- Rising market income inequality was offset by increased transfers and increased taxes

- Much of this was at the provincial level: surtaxes at the top and more generous social assistance at the bottom - with ongoing increases in both

- By mid-90s, every province but Alberta had over 10% of population on social assistance

Post 1996: Tax and transfer increases were reversed
the income tax liability. The expansions of the Canada Child

**Figure 6:** Average Tax Rate with Refundable Tax Credits Through Time for Married Family with Two Children

*Source: Calculations from the CTaCS calculator.*
Table: Social Assistance Benefit Rates
(Kneebone and White(2009))

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Ontario</th>
<th></th>
<th>BC</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Single Employ.</td>
<td>19.2%</td>
<td>-34%</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
<td>-17.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single w/child</td>
<td>19.6</td>
<td>-31.7</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>-12.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure: Berg (2012)

The large upward trend in Ontario welfare participation can be traced to a number of factors, including a decision by the province to raise welfare benefit rates every year between 1986 and 1992, as documented by the National Council of Welfare (1991, 1992).
Social Assistance Reforms

Reforms involved emphasis on work over receipt and diversion from SA

- **Ontario Works (1998).** Emphasis on moving applicants and recipients to work

- **BC:** under both NDP and Liberals, introduced a series of measures including an earned income tax credit, stricter evaluation of disabilities, waiting periods, maximum time limits, need to apply on-line

- Move toward a more US style system where emphasis is on aid to children and disabled and discouraging use or emphasizing work and training for others

- Liquid asset exemptions for lone parents were 5K in 1994 in both BC and Ontario. By 2009 $1550 in Ontario and $250 in BC
Part of a general shift along the lines recommended by OECD:

- Shift from Passive to Active Support

- WITB and Child Tax Credit fit in this: emphasis on transfers related to work

- Reforms to UI/EI in 1996 had the same goal
The New Contract

Key elements:

- Employment instead of transfers while out of employment

- Reduce regulation with the aim of improved efficiency leading to better jobs (and wages?)

- Emphasis on human capital

Georges Juergens, Deputy Head of Mission at the German Embassy in Ottawa (August 14):

”We now have both reached the point where you need to find innovation in order to jumpstart the markets, be it in more creative ways of deregulating labour markets, of deregulating export markets or deregulating industry growth,”
Labour Market Policies

Strong Emphasis on Employment

- Seem to want to move down the labour demand curve
  - Reduce union power (stepping into disputes)
  - Bringing in Temporary Foreign Workers to keep wages down in the West
  - Cutting payroll taxes
  - Cutting transfers reduces reservation wages and has this effect
Figure: Inequality Measured by the Gini has not Been Increasing
Did It Work?

Figure: Top 1% Income Share Grew Strongly after the Policy Shift
Figure: Low Income Rate Declined Strongly
Did It Work?

**Figure:** Male Employment Rates Conditional on Education Declined
Figure: Male Participation Rates Declined Even More
Did It Work?

Figure: Female Employment Rates Conditional on Education Improved

Employment Rate, Females, Age 25-44

Year
1990
1995
2000
2005
2010
2015

Employment Rate
50
55
60
65
70
75
80
85
90

HS Drop Outs
HS Grads
PS Grads
BA+

David A. Green
QIISP Presentation
Figure: Low Skilled Entry Wages Declined for Decades

Figure 6: Fitted Mean Hourly Earnings, LFS, High School Males, By Job Entry Cohorts
Figure: But Improved A lot in the 2000s

Growth in the Log Real Wage
Less than 2 years of Tenure, HS

Year
Female Male
Less than 2 years of Tenure, HS
Growth in the Log Real Wage

David A. Green
QIISP Presentation
Figure: This has a Strong Regional Dimension: Alberta

Growth in the Log Real Wage
Less than 2 years of Tenure, HS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Male</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Growth in the Log Real Wage
Less than 2 years of Tenure, HS

Did It Work?

Figure: Ontario
Figure: Manufacturing Decline Offset by Construction
Major Policy Shift in mid-90s: reduced access and generosity of transfers, reduced taxes

Labour Market Dimension: Emphasis on flexibility, human capital and employment

Inequality worsened at first then flat. Poverty improved. 1% share rose rapidly.
Conclusion

- Hasn’t delivered in terms of employment
- Wages have held constant or improved
- Whether this continues will depend on whether construction and resource sectors continue to offset manufacturing
- Regional trade-offs but also trade-offs between environmental and economic goals?