Quebec’s Childcare Win-Win

Presented at the Conference *The Millennials’ Challenge*
Queen’s International Institute on Social Policy
Kingston, August 24-26, 2015

Pierre Fortin
Department of Economics
University of Quebec at Montreal

Source: http://interventionseconomiques.revue.org/1858
Quebec’s Family Policy I

• Full-day kindergarten has been offered to all children aged 5 since September 1997
• Simultaneously, before and after-school daycare at $5 per day began to be offered to all children aged 5 to 12
• Since 2005, a provincial child support program has given increased family allowances to middle- and lower-income families in addition to the federal CCTB and UCCB
• Since 2006, a provincial parental insurance plan has made enhanced parental leaves available to new parents over and above the federal EI-based program
• In Quebec as in other provinces, children have been "removed from welfare"
• Key vision: connect family policy to labour market
Quebec’s Family Policy II

Early childhood education and care (EC2)

- Offered at $5 a day to all children aged 0 to 4 since September 2000
- Fee increased to $7 in January 2004, and to $7.30 in September 2014
- In April 2015, fee was maintained at $7.30 for annual family incomes below $50 k, and increased by steps to $20 for incomes above $155 k
- There are four types of regulated facilities: Early Childhood Centres (CPE, 32% of spaces), family-based services (33%), privately-owned subsidized facilities (16%), and private non-subsidized facilities (19%)
- First three types receive direct provincial subsidies
- All types give access to federal income tax deductions; provincial refundable income tax credit is also available to fourth type
- In 2014-15, the cost of this provincial low-fee childcare programme was $2.4bn, or 0.6% of GDP
What does EC2 policy aim for?

• EC2 aims primarily at fostering the development and well-being of our *tout-petits* and providing them with equality of opportunity

• EC2 is also meant to help parents reconcile their parental and professional duties

• Making everyone richer (including governments) was obviously not a goal of EC2, but it has nevertheless been an outcome (however initially unexpected)
Percentage of 0-to-4 year olds attending regulated child care has risen spectacularly.

Figure 1
Total number of regulated childcare spaces available as a percentage of 0-to-4-year-olds in Quebec and other provinces in 1998 and 2012.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Quebec</th>
<th>All other provinces</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Childcare Resource and Research Unit; Statistics Canada.
Participation in subsidized care is balanced across income groups

Figure 2
Percentage of Quebec families who use subsidized care among those who put at least one child in daycare while they work or go to school, by family income class

- Less than $50,000: 69%
- $50,000 to $100,000: 73%
- More than $50,000: 76%

Source: Institut de la statistique du Québec (2009 Survey).
Quebec women have joined the labour force *en masse*

**Figure 3**
Labour force participation rate of women aged 25 to 44 in Quebec and other provinces from 1996 to 2014

Source: Statistics Canada.
The number of lone-parent families on welfare has declined by 60%.
The completed lifetime fertility of recent cohorts has increased.

Completed lifetime fertility of successive cohorts of Quebec women born between 1951 and 1979 (number of children to 1,000 women).

Source: Institut de la statistique du Québec.
The percentage of women who have no children has declined among those born between 1951 and 1978.

Source: Institut de la statistique du Québec.
But the average age at birth of first child has continued to increase

Average age at birth of first child for successive cohorts of Quebec women, by year of birth of mother, 1951-1979 (years)

Source: Institut de la statistique du Québec.
Impact on children’s development: still room for improvement

1) Quality of child care in subsidized facilities in 2005 according to the study by Japel, Tremblay and Côté:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quality index</th>
<th>Percentage of facilities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Good</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inadequate</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2) The 2012 *Survey of Montreal Kindergarten Children* has shown that children from low-income families having attended a CPE are much less vulnerable than those who did not when they enter school.
The low-fee system is very popular

• In 2009, 92% of users of low-fee child care services said that the system fully satisfied their preferences
• Further, 66% of users of non-subsidized child care services said that they would prefer having access to a subsidized facility
• Two implications follow:

1) Being so popular, EC2 is there to stay    2) Supply of spaces still falls significantly short of demand (by 30,000 spaces, perhaps)
According to microeconomic evidence, Quebec’s EC2 has increased jobs, incomes and fiscal revenues

- Microeconometric research with longitudinal survey data was conducted at Toronto, UBC, MIT and UQAM

- Tallying up and extending their results (for 2008), our UQAM-Sherbrooke team has found that:
  - women’s employment was up by 70,000 (3.8%)
  - Quebec’s GDP was up by $5.1bn (1.7%)
  - the overall fiscal balance of the three levels of government was up by $0.9bn
Annual costs and benefits Ottawa and Quebec got in 2008 from having replaced the pre-2000 system by the low-fee system

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Quebec</td>
<td>$1,450</td>
<td>-$1,200</td>
<td>$250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>$650</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>$650</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>$2,100</strong></td>
<td><strong>-$1,200</strong></td>
<td><strong>$900</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- The cost of $1,200 million is the difference between the actual cost of the new system ($1,800 million) in 2008 and what the pre-2000 system would have cost in that year ($600 million).
- **Bottom line**: for each additional dollar spent, there is a net benefit of 55 cents for Ottawa and 20 cents for Quebec.
Policy implications

• Quebec’s EC2 system is more than paying for itself
• Even if it is a costly programme on surface, it does not require the government to increase taxes
• On the contrary, thanks to increased employment and economic activity, it generates a fiscal surplus that can be used for other purposes, including enhanced investment in 0-to-4 year olds from low-income families
• Furthermore, given the significant increase in fiscal revenue the federal revenue government gets from the programme, a federal contribution to low-fee childcare programmes in participating provinces (e.g., the Mulcair proposal) would be on sound financial footing
Making money is not at all the point, but it can help

• The basic objective of EC2 is better child development, a better balance between work and family for parents, and greater long-term financial autonomy for women
• It is not to have Ottawa and the provinces to make money out of it
• A favourable impact on public finances is neither a necessary nor a sufficient condition to put an EC2 system into place
• However, it may be helpful for convincing provincial ministers of finance to go for it
Challenges

- Making the supply of places meet the demand
- Rules of attribution of spaces
- Quality of education and care
- Training of personnel
- Special needs of children from poor families
- Financial autonomy of mothers
- Interaction between social classes
- Non-standard work schedules
- Unionization of staff